



REPORT TO:	OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
DATE:	7 OCTOBER 2010
REPORT OF THE:	HEAD OF ENVIRONMENT PHIL LONG
TITLE OF REPORT:	REPAIRS TO FORMER TOWN HALL, MALTON
WARDS AFFECTED:	ALL

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 As requested by the Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 19 August 2010 this report provides an update on the position regarding the repairs to the roof and stonework at the former Town Hall, Malton. The report was to outline the history of the project and progress to date.

2.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 2.1 It is recommended that Members receive this report and note the contents.

3.0 REASONS SUPPORTING DECISION

- 3.1 The report updates members regarding the history of the project and reasons for the works delay. The report makes reference to and updates an earlier report regarding delays to the Town Hall roof presented to the Overview and Scrutiny on 20 December 2009.

4.0 REPORT DETAILS

- 4.1 The former Town Hall is owned by the Fitzwilliam Malton Estate and the Council negotiated a maximum three-year extension to the lease in 2009. The tenant is required to keep the property in good and tenantable repair.
- 4.2 Problems were identified with the roof fabric in the mid to late 1990's in that tiles were becoming dislodged on a regular basis. It was decided at the time to carry out the repair work.
- 4.3 It became evident in late 2007 that tile slips were occurring with increasing regularity. Accordingly, a full condition survey was commissioned and carried out by an external surveyor. This survey was carried out in July 2008 by Building Care and Conservation. The report also identified issues with the stonework, however it was already known that work would need to be carried out to the external fabric before the end of the lease.

4.4 As previously reported to O&S on 20 December 2009 the following actions took place.

- A hoarding was established to the west elevation in order to protect the public.
- Brick chimney stacks were lowered down to a safe height.
- Results of the survey were reported to the Resources Working Party on 26 August 2008. After consideration at the Policy and Resources Committee on the 2 October, on the 6 November 2008 it was agreed at Full Council to carry out the re-roofing and stonework works.
- Works regarding the roof were advertised in the local press during late November /early December and tenders were returned by 23 January 2009. Two tenders were received.
- These were reported to the Policy and Resources Committee meeting on 2 April 2009, where it was resolved (minute 396) that the Chief Executive be given delegated authority in consultation with the Chairman of the Policy and Resources Committee to accept:-
 - The tender of Alan Shaw Roofing of York in the sum of £79,531.33 for the re-roofing works to the former Town Hall, Malton and
 - A suitable quotation for repairs to the exterior stonework.
- A conservation Architect was engaged during late 2008 to schedule and prepare a suitable specification in order to enable quotations to be obtained for the stonework repairs. These works were estimated to be approximately £30,000 by the conservation Architect. Prices were received just prior to the Policy and Resources meeting and varied from £84,600 to £128,433.80, these tenders had not been fully evaluated before the meeting. In view of the prices obtained the conservation architect was requested to re-assess the extent of work planned.
- Following the Policy and Resources meeting on the 2 April 2009, the Chief Executive met with the Property Manager to review the files and papers for the contract for the roof repairs. At this time it came to light that there were some omissions in the completion of the tender documentation by the lowest tenderer which raised questions around whether the tender was valid and could be accepted. As a result of this further work was undertaken internally to establish whether this contract could be awarded.
- Simultaneously the significant cost from the stonework had been evaluated. It was now clear that there was insufficient financial provision within the budget to award the two elements of the scheme. It had also been originally intended that some shared or concurrent use of scaffolding would be undertaken to reduce costs however the lowest tenderer for the roofing works had difficulties with this issue and therefore additional costs would need to be considered as the stonework contract was not ready to be let.

4.5 As reported to this committee on 20 December 2009 the original intention was to re-tender the re-roofing works in early 2010, with a view to starting works on site in spring. With regard to the stonework, clearly the first set of quotations was substantially outside the estimate suggested by the conservation architect. The architect reviewed the scope of works and it was proposed that the revised works would be tendered after the roofing tenders are known and subject to the available budget, it was anticipated that the stonework repairs would follow on from the re-roofing works, probably during autumn 2010. At that point it was still the intention to attempt to minimise costs by considering the shared use of scaffolding for the two pieces of work.

- 4.6 On reviewing the specification and supporting documentation a bat survey was required. Starting work without having undertaken the bat survey could potentially have led to significant delays and therefore additional costs. The emergence (bat) survey could not take place until late June 2010 due to the nature of the certain times of year when bats leave their roosts. To begin work not knowing whether bats were roosting in the roof at the time could potentially lead to the imposition of fines and long delays with a contractor on site potentially claiming costs including scaffold hire etc without being able to progress the work. During this time, the specification was reviewed and amended in consultation with the Conservation Officer and the Fitzwilliam Estate to identify the scope and method of work. The works were then retendered.
- 4.7 The retendering took place with the assistance of the procurement partnership. Electronic tendering took place and 42 companies viewed the tender and 7 were shortlisted. A total of 6 tenders were received on 28 July 2010. The analysis was undertaken and references consulted and no omissions were found. Financial checks carried out on the contractor indicated a low risk in this respect and the contract was awarded to the lowest tender of £52,978.65 from the contractor, Martin Brooks (Roofing Specialists) Ltd, who have extensive experience in this type of work and very good references from the likes of the National Trust. Following pre-start meetings and further consultation with Fitzwilliam Estate and the Conservation Officer, the contractor proposed a start date of 6 September and agreed to a proposed contract duration of 10 weeks.
- 4.8 The repairs to the stonework are currently under review having followed a similar process to that of the assessment of the specification for the roof. The benefit of using the same scaffold has been reconsidered and would have likely led to significant delays with the progress of the roof works.
- 4.9 Negotiations regarding the potential scope of stonework repair required to the external masonry and the extent of RDC liability for it are ongoing. It is expected that this can be agreed over the coming months with a view to undertaking a tender exercise for the work in the spring of 2011 and potentially carrying out the necessary work throughout the late spring and early summer months.

5.0 IMPLICATIONS

5.1 The following implications have been identified:

- a) Financial
The revised quote of £52,978.65 represents a substantial 33.39% saving over the original quote of £79,531.33. Additional costs have been incurred of approximately £1,900 over the period between the original tenders having been received and starting work on site.
- b) Legal
Landlord's permission is required for the work and consultation has been undertaken with the Estate. Works are subject to a JCT Standard Form of Contract.
- c) Other (Equalities, Staffing, Planning, Health & Safety, Environmental, Crime & Disorder).
No significant issues arise other than those highlighted in the report.

Phil Long
Head of Environment

Background Papers:
None

OFFICER CONTACT:

Please contact Phil Long if you require any further information on the contents of this report. The officer can be contacted at Ryedale House on 01653 600666 or e-mail phil.long@ryedale.gov.uk.